

# Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) Strategic Advisory Group

MINUTES

10:00-12:30,  
18 APRIL 2018

LONDONWIDE LMC'S,  
TAVISTOCK HOUSE

<b>MEETING CALLED BY</b>	WRES Strategic Advisory Group
<b>ATTENDEES</b>	See annex
<b>APOLOGIES</b>	See annex
<b>NOTE TAKER</b>	WRES Implementation Team
<b>WELCOME &amp; INTRODUCTIONS</b>	Marie Gabriel

## Agenda topics

### WELCOME AND INTRODUCTIONS

**MARIE GABRIEL**

<b>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</b>	<p>Marie welcomed SAG members to the meeting, as well as the three guests from the University of Sheffield:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Professor Jeremy Dawson</li><li>• Fiona Sampson</li><li>• Melanie Rimmer</li></ul> <p>Apologies were received from the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Adam Sewell-Jones</li><li>• Dr Buki Adeyemo</li><li>• Garrett Emmerson</li><li>• Dame Gill Morgan</li><li>• Dr Stephanie Hatch</li><li>• Jabeer Butt</li><li>• Saffron Cordery</li><li>• Stephen Dorrell</li><li>• Professor Ted Baker</li><li>• Alina Grossman</li><li>• Jacqueline Dunkley-Bent</li></ul> <p>Marie updated on the WRES SAG membership, noting that Dido Harding, the chair of NHS Improvement, will be joining the WRES SAG within her role and capacity as an ALB chair.</p> <p>It was noted that Richard Parish, Public Health England, would be standing down and that conversations will be held as to representation from that organisation.</p> <p>Sir Keith Pearson's term at Health Education England comes to an end in June. A thank you letter will be written and sent to Sir Keith, thanking him for his dedicated work on this forum, including for some time, as chair of the SAG.</p> <p><u>ACTION</u>: Marie Gabriel to send 'thank you' note to Sir Keith on behalf of the SAG.</p>
------------------------------------	---

# Paper: WRES SAG 1

	Professor Mala Rao will be joining the WRES team to work on WRES and the medical workforce. This will create an opportunity and opening for a Vice-Chair position on the SAG.
--	---

## MATTERS ARISING

**ALL**

<b>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</b>	<p>The minutes of the previous meeting (10 January 2017) were agreed with the following two amendments:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Professor Dean Fathers noted that his apologies for the January meeting needed recording;</li> <li>2. Jabeer Butt, via email, reminded the SAG for the need to look at WRES related analysis by sex and ethnicity (intersectionality).</li> </ol> <p><u>Actions from 10 January meeting:</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Neil Churchill was to liaise with the NHS Ombudsman re: the idea of joining the WRES SAG. Professor Dean Fathers stated that he would be very happy to represent the Ombudsman in his new role. Dean will inform Neil.</li> <li>2. Lord Victor Adebowale reminded the SAG that he needed to follow up on his two actions: (i) to raise the WRES agenda with the primary care commissioning sub-committee; (ii) the role of WRES re: subcontracting and outsourcing. He will need support from the WRES team to take these issues forward.</li> <li>3. The work on how WRES features in middle-management development is now part of an ongoing workstream of the Equality and Diversity Council, which is considering leadership and equality. This group is chaired by Marie and attended by relevant SAG members - this approach will reduce duplication.</li> <li>4. SAG members need to write blogs on a rotational basis, including starting with Marie, who noted that she was close to completing her blog.</li> <li>5. Yvonne reminded SAG members of the Windrush70 awards event on 12 June. She recognised the contribution from NHS Confederation re: providing the venue for the event for free. Yvonne encouraged other organisations represented on the SAG to contribute by nominating BME (and non-BME) staff, from over the seven decades, for an award, and in helping to promote the event. She encouraged all SAG members to attend the event.</li> </ol> <p>All other actions were completed.</p>
------------------------------------	---

## ALB WRES DATA

**HABIB NAQVI AND  
OWEN CHINEMBIRI**

<b>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</b>	<p>Habib Naqvi and Owen Chinembiri presented the 2017 WRES data for the Arm's Length Bodies (ALBs). Six ALBs submitted their WRES data to the national WRES team for analysis and reporting, these included: Care Quality Commission, Health Education England, NHS England, NHS Digital, NHS Improvement, and Public Health England. The final ALB WRES data report was published on 28 March.</p> <p>Findings in general presented poorer experience and opportunities for BME staff across the six ALBs. The quality of data was one of the key issues identified, including the level of 'unknown' or undisclosed ethnicity for some of the WRES indicators – especially relating to board membership.</p> <p>Discussion relating to the lack of BME staff in senior and leadership positions across the ALBs, and across the NHS in general, followed with the following</p>
------------------------------------	---

## Paper: WRES SAG 1

	<p>key points made:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The importance of succession planning and talent management was emphasized.</li> <li>• The critical role of chairs of organisations, and their Boards, in leading transformation of culture and process.</li> <li>• The important role of ALBs as role models should also not be underestimated.</li> <li>• It was noted that Dame Dido Harding will be organizing a meeting for the chairs of the national ALBs, in response to these findings. One-to-one follow-up work from the WRES team with ALB Boards may be best given the differences between the organisations, as well as having the joint meeting.</li> <li>• It would be useful for the ALBs to consider where they want to be on the data indicators, and the agenda as a whole, and the 3 or 4 key impacts that will help them secure improvement.</li> </ul> <p>The ALBs were thanked for the openness and transparency with which they submitted their WRES data. This was viewed as an important and necessary exercise, and the WRES team was encouraged to extend the annual reporting of WRES data to include other key healthcare ALBs.</p> <p><u>ACTION:</u> WRES team to support Dame Dido Harding with regards to organising the ALB chairs' meeting re: WRES data and next steps.</p> <p><u>ACTION:</u> WRES team to invite other ALBs to submit their respective WRES data for annual reporting.</p>
--	---

### WRES EVALUATION

**JEREMY DAWSON, FIONA SAMPSON, MELANIE RIMMER**

<p><b>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</b></p>	<p>Jeremy Dawson and colleagues presented the interim findings of the independent evaluation of WRES programme. They highlighted that this was the first phase evaluation, focusing upon the design and initial implementation of the WRES programme, and included a combination of both quantitative and qualitative methods. SAG members were reminded that deep-dive investigations with a range of NHS organisations were scheduled over the coming months and that the initial learning points may change as a consequence.</p> <p>The interim headlines included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The WRES had gained a significant level of traction across the NHS, there is some indication of continuous improvement across the WRES indicators over time, and continued momentum is required going forward.</li> <li>• Succession planning and leadership of the WRES programme was critical – sustainability and continuity of approach were important considerations.</li> <li>• 'Monitoring fatigue' relating to NHS organisations should be avoided – particularly in light of the planned Workforce Disability Equality Standard (WDES).</li> </ul> <p>SAG members discussed the importance of further amplifying the narrative on the importance of this agenda, including the links between doing well on</p>
---	--

## Paper: WRES SAG 1

	<p>workforce race equality and other key markers relating to patient, staff; business efficiency and organisational improvements. There was also the opportunity to outline the beneficial impact on white staff.</p> <p>The importance of regulation and CQC inspections in particular was discussed. The degree to which WRES features within the final CQC inspection report to trusts (hospitals) was flagged as an area for further discussion and focus for both the WRES team and CQC.</p> <p>The meeting also raised the relationship with Freedom to Speak Up and the need to ensure that the evaluation considered how WRES can operate within an Integrated Care System (ICS).</p> <p>The WRES SAG thanked Jeremy and his colleagues for the ongoing work on the WRES evaluation and for sharing the interim headlines. It was noted that Jeremy and his team would be asked to present the final evaluation report at the October meeting of the SAG.</p> <p><b>ACTION:</b> WRES team to secure item on 'WRES and CQC regulation' for the July meeting of the WRES SAG.</p> <p><b>ACTION:</b> WRES team to invite Jeremy Dawson and colleagues to present final WRES evaluation at the October meeting of the WRES SAG.</p>
--	---

### WRES TEAM WORK UPDATE

**YVONNE COGHILL AND  
HABIB NAQVI**

<p><b>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</b></p>	<p>Yvonne Coghill and Habib Naqvi outlined current WRES work being undertaken by the WRES team and presented an update of the workstreams as they appear under the three strategic pillars of the WRES strategy:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Enabling People: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• WRES expert programme – was launched in March 2018. Fifty candidates were recruited in the first cohort of the programme. Early feedback on content is very positive.</li> <li>• Regional roundtables with CEOs and chairs of NHS trusts – to be carried out jointly with NHS Confederation over the coming months, starting in Newcastle later in April. It was noted that we needed to consider how to encourage all NHS trusts to attend.</li> </ul> </li> <li>2. Embedding Accountability: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• It was noted that a series of WRES webinars for CQC inspectors had commenced – a total of four webinars are planned over April and May.</li> <li>• Work with Greater Manchester on extending the WRES across health and social care has commenced, and it was noted that Sir David Dalton was involved in this work.</li> </ul> </li> <li>3. Evidencing Outcomes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The good work of organisations undertaking the QI methodology with regard to the WRES data outlined, and it was noted that a final report on this area of work would be made available in the coming months.</li> <li>• Mala Rao highlighted initial thoughts on work to be carried out relating to WRES and medics; these will be discussed further with the SAG.</li> </ul> </li> </ol> <p>The WRES SAG thanked the WRES team for the ongoing and high quality of work emerging.</p>
---	--

## Paper: WRES SAG 1

### WRES PROGRAMME: NEXT PHASE

ALL

<b>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</b>	<p>SAG members were unanimous in their view that the WRES programme should continue as a stand alone approach. This was because :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is a clear need to sustain the conversations as WRES beginning to gain real momentum.</li> <li>• There is a need to embed the improvements already secured and to see out the approach to integrated care systems.</li> <li>• There is need for the national team to continue to support delivery, whilst the WRES Experts Programme rolls out capability and capacity across the system and to try out new models of support between NHS trusts within regions.</li> <li>• There was significant interest in the sustainability of the WRES programme following the Race Disparity Audit publication and emerging work, and there is an opportunity to build on this work further going forward.</li> <li>• Closer alignment of NHS England and NHS Improvement may help with the above (example of regional presence and a national team re: Freedom to Speak Up work was noted).</li> <li>• Mission was not accomplished and that there was a risk that this agenda and the excellent work of the WRES team to date would disappear.</li> <li>• The stability and sustainability of the WRES programme and therefore the permanency of the WRES team, and the programme as a whole, was needed. This is also a opportunity for the ALBs to illustrate their commitment as they seek support for their individual organisations.</li> </ul> <p><u>ACTION:</u> It was noted that an update on the next phase and future of the WRES programme would feature at the July meeting of the SAG.</p>
------------------------------------	---

### ANY OTHER BUSINESS

ALL

<b>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</b>	<p>Marie noted that the WRES SAG Vice-Chair position was available, following the move of Prof Mala Rao to the WRES team. Marie opened expressions of interest from SAG members at the meeting – Danny Mortimer put himself forward for the position.</p> <p>Marie noted that if she did not receive any further interest from SAG members following an email to members, including from those that were not present at this meeting, Danny would become the Vice-Chair starting from the July meeting. If there were other expressions then a process would be undertaken via the SAG secretariat.</p> <p><u>ACTION:</u> SAG secretariat to send email to full WRES SAG members re: expressions of interest for the WRES SAG Vice-Chair position – setting a deadline date for any self-nominations.</p>
------------------------------------	---

### ADD THANK YOU NOTE TO KEITH

ACTION ITEMS LIST	PERSON RESPONSIBLE	DEADLINE
1. Follow-up with the NHS Ombudsman of joining the WRES SAG. Dean Fathers to inform Neil of the outcome.	Dean Fathers	June 2018

## Paper: WRES SAG 1

2. To raise the WRES agenda with the primary care commissioning sub-committee.	Lord Victor Adebawale	July 2018
3. Explore the role of WRES re: subcontracting and outsourcing, with support from the WRES team.	Lord Victor, Lord Prior and WRES team	July 2018
4. SAG members to write topical blogs on the agenda.	SAG members with WRES team / secretariat	July 2018
5. WRES team to support Dame Dido Harding with regards to organising the ALB chairs' meeting re: WRES data and next steps.	Dame Harding and WRES team	September 2018
6. WRES team to invite other ALBs to submit their respective WRES data for annual reporting.	WRES team	July 2018
7. WRES team to secure item on 'WRES and CQC regulation' for the July meeting of the WRES SAG.	WRES team / secretariat and CQC	July 2018
8. WRES team to invite Jeremy Dawson and colleagues to present final WRES evaluation at the October meeting of the WRES SAG.	WRES team / secretariat	July 2018
9. A substantial item focusing on the next phase and future of the WRES programme would feature at the July meeting of the SAG.	WRES team / secretariat	July 2018
10. Marie to send email to full WRES SAG members re: expressions of interest for the WRES SAG vice-chair position – setting a deadline date for any self-nominations.	Marie Gabriel / secretariat	June 2018

<b>DATES OF FUTURE MEETINGS</b>	Thursday 12 July 2018, 10:00-12:30, London-wide LMCs, Tavistock House South, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG
---------------------------------	--

# Paper: WRES SAG 1

## ANNEX MEETING OF THE WRES STRATEGIC ADVISORY GROUP – ATTENDANCE 18 April 2018

Name	Job Title	Organisation
<b>Attended</b>		
<b>Dr Henrietta Hughes</b>	National Guardian for the NHS	National Guardian's Office
<b>Dr Habib Naqvi</b>	Policy Lead - WRES	NHS England
<b>Joan Saddler</b>	Deputy Director	NHS Confederation
<b>Karen Bonner</b>	Director of Nursing	Chelsea and Westminster Hospital NHS FT
<b>Lord Victor Adebawale</b>	Non-executive Director	NHS England
<b>Lord David Prior</b>	Chair	UCLH
<b>Sir David Dalton</b>	Chair	Salford Royal NHS TH
<b>Danny Mortimer</b>	CEO	NHS Employers
<b>Marie Gabriel</b>	Chair	East London NHS FT
<b>Michelle Drage</b>	CEO	London-wide LMCs
<b>Owen Chinembiri</b>	Analyst - WRES	NHS England
<b>Poppy Jaman</b>	CEO	Mental Health First Aid
<b>Prof Dean Fathers</b>	Chair	Nottingham Healthcare Trust
<b>Prof Mala Rao</b>	Professor & Senior Clinical Fellow	Imperial College London / Public Health England
<b>Rob Webster</b>	Chief Executive	South West Yorkshire Partnership NHS FT
<b>Stephen Hart</b>	National Director	NHS Leadership Academy
<b>Yvonne Coghill</b>	Director - WRES	NHS England
<b>Apologies</b>		
<b>Adam Sewell-Jones</b>	Executive Director of Improvement	NHS Improvement
<b>Dr Neil Churchill</b>	Director	NHS England
<b>Dr Buki Adeyemo</b>	Medical Director	North Stoke Combined NHS Trust
<b>Garrett Emmerson</b>	CEO	London Ambulance NHS Trust
<b>Dame Gill Morgan</b>	Chair	NHS Providers
<b>Dr Stephanie Hatch</b>	Academic	Kings College London
<b>Jabeer Butt</b>	Deputy Chief Executive Officer	Race Equality Foundation
<b>Saffron Cordery</b>	Director	NHS Providers
<b>Stephen Dorrell</b>	Chair	NHS Confederation
<b>Prof Ted Baker</b>	Chief Inspector - Hospitals	CQC
<b>Alina Grossman</b>	Clinical Fellow	OCDO Clinical Leaders of the Future Programme
<b>Jacqueline Dunkley-Bent</b>	Head of Maternity, Children & Young People	NHS England
<b>Jon Restell</b>	CEO	Managers in Partnership
<b>Guest presenters</b>		
<b>Prof Jeremy Dawson</b>	Prof of Health Management	The University of Sheffield
<b>Fiona Sampson</b>	Researcher	The University of Sheffield

## Paper: WRES SAG 1

<b>Melanie Rimmer</b>	Researcher	The University of Sheffield
-----------------------	------------	-----------------------------