

Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) Strategic Advisory Group

MINUTES

10:00-12:30,
11 OCTOBER 2018

LONDON-WIDE LMC,
TAVISTOCK HOUSE, LONDON

MEETING CALLED BY	WRES Strategic Advisory Group
ATTENDEES	See Annex
APOLOGIES	See Annex
NOTE TAKER	WRES Implementation Team
WELCOME & INTRODUCTIONS	Danny Mortimer

Agenda topics

INTRODUCTIONS AND REVIEW OF PREVIOUS MINUTES AND ACTIONS

DANNY MORTIMER

DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS	<p>Danny noted apologies from the chair, Marie Gabriel, and chaired the meeting in his role of vice-chair. All other apologies are presented in the Annex.</p> <p>Danny welcomed SAG members to the meeting, as well as the following guest presenters:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dr David Ashton - David Ashton Development Ltd • Jennifer Izeke - Inspiring Hope Ltd • Chris Gonde – King’s College Hospital NHS FT • Sinead O’Neil – Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust • Shahana Ramsden – NHS England <p>Due to external guest presentations with regard to two agenda items, minutes from the previous meeting, and associated actions, were reviewed following those items. However, for the purpose of these minutes, the previous actions are noted immediately below.</p> <p>There were no amendments to the minutes of the July WRES SAG meeting. Outstanding and ongoing actions from the previous meeting:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. WRES team to identify another route by which to engage with the primary care sub-committee, and to explore the role of subcontracting/outsourcing. 2. Stephen Hart, Sir David Dalton, Danny Mortimer volunteered to write blogs on workforce race equality and the WRES during October (Black History Month). It was noted that Dorset NHS Trust CEO, Patricia Miller, and Baroness Dido Harding are also approached by the WRES team to consider writing a blog. The blogs to be shared with NHS Providers for promotion. 3. Note from Neil Churchill re: next steps for the WRES programme to be circulated to the SAG before the next meeting in January. 4. WRES is set to feature in the NHS Long Term Plan section on workforce. 5. Work between the WRES team and NHS Improvement re: cultural transformation is ongoing. 6. CQC WRES composite score item update to be brought back to the January SAG meeting.
------------------------------------	--

**DISCUSSION/
CONCLUSIONS**

Dr David Ashton provided background to the WRES frontline forum, including its aims to capture the lived experience of workforce race equality in frontline staff across the NHS, and to ascertain qualitative feedback on the impact of WRES from the system. Twenty NHS staff from across the country form the first cohort, these include nurses, doctors as well as managers.

David directed the SAG to the accompanying paper for the item for detail regarding the forum's activity to date, including presenting at national events and conferences and holding seminars and workshops in local NHS organisations. Many of the members have spoken about their personal stories and their journey in the NHS. These have been captured on various media formats, including as digital stories. The forum has given its members a platform that they may not have had, both at national and local level.

Yvonne Coghill noted how much of an asset the forum members are to the WRES programme, to their respective organisations and to the agenda as a whole.

A number of key points were discussed by SAG members, including ensuring:

- the SAG continues to provide full support to the forum, and that a second cohort be considered by the WRES team;
- the valuable data and intelligence from the forum is put to good use;
- that the chairs and CEOs of forum members' organisations are aware of the forum, and the expertise and skills that their member of staff has, and to make best use of that;
- CQC makes best use of the skills and knowledge of forum members as part of the CQC 'well-led' inspection process, and in-line with the forthcoming WRES composite score;
- that this is not the end of the forum – this must be seen as a 'process' and not an 'event', there needs to be continuity and some element of sustainability of this approach;
- the qualitative data (e.g. anecdotes and quotes) are included alongside the visualisation of the annual WRES quantitative data report.

Danny thanked David Ashton for his work and asked him to convey the sincere gratitude of the SAG to the invaluable work that they are undertaking.

ACTIONS:

1. Further tightening of how WRES features in CQC inspections of the 'well-led' domain, including the weighting of the WRES in final inspection ratings, needs further work and needs to be brought back to the SAG.
2. Letter to be sent from Marie to sponsors and CEOs of forum members that outlines the profile of the forum, and the connection with CQC regulation re: the role that forum members can play as part of the inspection process.
3. Insight from cohort one of the Forum should be included in the annual WRES data report – to help bring the data to life.
4. Offer the opportunity of forum members presenting at the ALB chairs' WRES meeting being convened by Baroness Dido Harding.
5. Consideration to be given to sustainability of the forums and their presence at both national and local levels.

WRES EXPERTS PROGRAMME

JENNIFER IZEKOR

**DISCUSSION/
CONCLUSIONS**

Jennifer Izekor presented on behalf of Inspiring Hope, the organisation commissioned to facilitate the WRES Experts programme. Jennifer directed the SAG to the accompanying paper, and reminded members that 46 delegates are part of cohort one of the WRES Experts programme. The final two of the six programme modules will be delivered later in October, thus completing the programme for cohort one.

Jennifer reminded the SAG of the aims of the programme: to develop local-level experts on the WRES so that they can help support WRES implementation within their local NHS organisation and across local healthcare footprints, thus helping to decentralise WRES support and help facilitate sustainability of the agenda.

The three WRES Experts present at the SAG meeting presented on their respective experiences of being on the programme. Key themes from their presentations noted how the WRES Experts programme has:

- given delegates confidence, skills and tools to help organisations to continuously improve on workforce race equality – including interpretation of data to amplify the narrative and to explore the root causes of inequality
- enabled delegates to be able to have honest conversations with colleagues and senior leaders about the agenda
- supported delegates to be their true authentic selves at work – not seen or experienced with other ‘race’ or ‘development’ programmes of the past

Jennifer reminded SAG members that the end of programme celebration event for cohort one is on 30 November in London, and all SAG members are invited to attend.

SAG members thanked the WRES Experts and stressed the powerful impact and importance of the programme. The longer-term capacity and sustainability of the programme was highlighted; the profiling and communication of the 46 Experts to the system was noted.

The use of innovative and interactive media, including ‘talking heads’ on video, was identified as a communications approach to take forward with regard to the WRES Experts. Particularly in time for NHS Providers CEO and chairs’ event on 6 December.

The Experts should now be approached to become involved in programmes of work across the NHS. It was also questioned whether this programme of work can be captured in the mandatory and non-mandatory equality and diversity training in the NHS.

It was noted that the NHS Leadership Academy, NHS Improvement and WRES team should consider how the WRES could be incorporated into a single board development offer – utilizing learning from the WRES and Quality Improvement work.

ACTIONS:

1. WRES Experts directory to be shared with SAG members when finalised.
2. ‘Talking heads’ short videos (linked to WRES indicator themes) with WRES Experts to be produced for communication purposes by December.
3. WRES Experts to be part of the CQC inspection process.
4. WRES team and NHS Leadership Academy to think about embedding and

Paper: WRES SAG 1

- aligning this programme within the system – an offer to boards/governors.
5. NHS Leadership Academy, NHS Improvement and WRES team to consider how the WRES could be incorporated into a single board development offer.

WRES TEAM WORK: UPDATE

YVONNE COGHILL, DR HABIB NAQVI AND PROF MALA RAO

DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS

Yvonne Coghill and Habib Naqvi outlined the highlights of current WRES work being undertaken by the WRES team and presented an update of the workstreams as they appear under the three strategic pillars of the WRES strategy:

- Enabling People:
 - Regional roundtables with CEOs and chairs of NHS trusts – have been carried out jointly with NHS Confederation. These have been very successful and are resulting in CEOs at regional levels working together on action planning and the sharing of good practice.
 - A specific focus of the WRES team is upon London – a small group of London CEOs, led by Sir David Sloman, John Brouder and Navina Evans, has written to all NHS trust CEOs in London inviting them to a meeting on 17 December to have a leadership conversation on this agenda. A parallel meeting for London chairs is being organised by Marie and Baroness Dido Harding.
- Embedding Accountability:
 - Work with Greater Manchester on extending the WRES across health and social care – and other parts of the public sector is now underway, and it was noted that Habib sits on the steering group and Sir David Dalton is involved in this work. Sir David thanked Habib for his ongoing work in Greater Manchester.
- Evidencing Outcomes:
 - Five NHS organisations have undertaken QI methodology with regard to the WRES, and a draft report on this area of work was made available to SAG members. SAG members noted the importance of QI methodology, and the need to share this report with the WRES Experts.

Mala Rao presented a paper on the WRES and the BME medical workforce, which makes up almost 50% of all doctors in the NHS. Mala highlighted the workforce race inequalities for doctors in the NHS, including the lack of opportunity for promotion and progression, the lesser likelihood of BME doctors receiving clinical excellence awards, and the poor experience within the workplace.

Mala stated three key points: (i) that the WRES indicators are heavily geared towards Agenda for Change and therefore exclude the medical (clinical) workforce; (ii) there will be action plan that on this area of work that will be tabled in front of the SAG, and (iii) on 9 November there is a WRES workshop for key stakeholders in the medical workforce – and that the SAG members are invited to that workshop.

The SAG advised Mala that this work should prioritise the experience of UK graduates, and noted the importance of including medical schools as part of the broader discussion on this particular agenda; the necessity to focus on other clinical staff and occupational groups in the NHS (e.g. paramedics, AHPs); the need to look at the granularity of data and intersectionality – e.g. BME women.

Paper: WRES SAG 1

	<p>The WRES SAG thanked the WRES team for the ongoing and high quality of work emerging.</p> <p>ACTIONS:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. WRES Experts to be invited to present at the London CEOs and chairs' meetings in December. 2. WRES team to consider short summary of the QI report, as well as using other media and communications routes for disseminating the key findings from the report. 3. WRES team to highlight and profile, through communications, the work that they are undertaking (with others) across Greater Manchester. 4. SAG members to be sent details for the 9 November workshop on WRES and the medical workshop. 5. WRES and medical workforce action plan to also include undergraduate medical education, and to be brought back to the SAG once developed. 6. Secretariat to approach Public Health England and Health Education England re: representation on the SAG.
--	---

IMPROVING BME REPRESENTATION: PROPOSAL

**DR HABIB NAQVI AND
YVONNE COGHILL**

<p>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</p>	<p>Habib Naqvi introduced the item, outlining the announcement made by the Cabinet Office on 11 October regarding: (i) ethnicity pay gap reporting; (ii) Race at Work Charter – signed by private and public sector organisations, and (iii) increasing BME staff at senior and board levels across the public sector.</p> <p>Yvonne and Habib informed the SAG that the WRES team has been working with the Cabinet Office and the Race Disparity Unity regarding feeding in WRES data to the Race Disparity Audit website. They also informed the SAG that the WRES team has been asked to work on a response, on behalf of the NHS, to point (iii) above. A paper regarding this has been sent to Simon Stevens for review and will be shared with the SAG following sign-off/feedback.</p> <p>SAG members noted the importance of looking at the Appointments Committee, an issue also raised at the October meeting of the NHS Equality and Diversity Council.</p> <p>ACTIONS:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. WRES team to circulate the above noted paper to the SAG once given clearance from NHS England.
---	--

ANY OTHER BUSINESS

ALL

<p>DISCUSSION/ CONCLUSIONS</p>	<p>A note of thanks was given to the WRES team for the high quality on-going work produced.</p>
---	---

Paper: WRES SAG 1

ACTION ITEMS LIST	PERSON(S) RESPONSIBLE	DEADLINE
1. Identify another route by which to engage with the primary care sub-committee, and the exploration of subcontracting/outsourcing.	WRES team	January 2019
2. Stephen Hart, Sir David Dalton, Danny Mortimer to write blogs on workforce race equality and the WRES. Patricia Miller and Baroness Dido Harding to be approached to do the same.	Mentioned SAG members with the support of WRES team	November 2018
3. Note from Neil Churchill re: next steps for the WRES programme to be circulated to the SAG.	Neil Churchill	November 2018
4. CQC WRES composite score item update to be brought back to the January SAG meeting.	Ted Baker and Lisa Annaly (CQC)	January 2019
5. Further tightening of how WRES features in CQC inspections of the 'well-led' – including WRES Expert and Staff Forum representation.	Ted Baker with support of WRES team	January 2019
6. Letter to be sent from Marie to sponsors and CEOs of WRES staff forum members.	Marie Gabriel	November 2018
7. Insight from cohort one of the WRES staff forum to be included in the annual WRES data report.	WRES team	December 2018
8. WRES staff forum members and WRES Experts to be utilised in ongoing WRES work.	WRES team	Ongoing
6. WRES Experts directory to be shared with SAG members when finalised.	WRES team	November 2018
7. 'Talking heads' short videos (linked to WRES indicator themes) with WRES Experts to be produced.	WRES team	December 2018
8. Alignment of WRES Experts programme within the system – an offer to boards/governors.	WRES team / Gill Morgan / Dido Harding	January 2019
9. Short summary of the QI report to be produced, and other media used to communicate key messages.	WRES team	January 2019
10. SAG members to be sent invite to the 9 November workshop on WRES and the medical workshop.	WRES team	October 2018
11. WRES and medical workforce action plan to be brought back to the SAG once developed.	WRES team	January 2019
12. Public Health England and Health Education England to be approached re: representation on the SAG.	WRES team	January 2019
13. BME leadership aspirations paper to be circulated to the SAG once given clearance.	WRES team	November 2018

Paper: WRES SAG 1

DATES OF FUTURE MEETINGS	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 10 January 2019, 10:00-12:30• 25 April 2019, 10:00-12:30• 31 July 2019, 10:00-12:30• 17 October 2019, 10:00-12:30 <p>The above meetings will be at: London-wide LMCs, Tavistock House South, Tavistock Square, London WC1H 9LG</p>
---------------------------------	---

Paper: WRES SAG 1

ANNEX

MEETING OF THE WRES STRATEGIC ADVISORY GROUP – ATTENDANCE 11 October 2018

Name	Job Title	Organisation
Attended		
Jacqueline Dunkley-Bent	Head of Maternity, Children & Young People	NHS England
Karen Bonner	Director of Nursing	Chelsea and Westminster Hospital NHS FT
Sir David Dalton	Chair	Salford Royal NHS TH
Lord Victor Adebowale	Non-executive Director	NHS England
Joan Saddler	Deputy Director	NHS Confederation
Danny Mortimer	CEO	NHS Employers
Stephen Hart	National Director	NHS Leadership Academy
Dr Habib Naqvi	Policy Lead - WRES	NHS England
Prof Mala Rao	Professor & Senior Clinical Fellow	Imperial College London / Public Health England
Yvonne Coghill	Director - WRES	NHS England
Dr Stephanie Hatch	Academic	Kings College London
Jabeer Butt	Deputy Chief Executive Officer	Race Equality Foundation
Garrett Emmerson	CEO	London Ambulance Service NHS Trust
Dame Gill Morgan	Chair	NHS Providers
Stephen Dorrell	Chair	NHS Confederation
Natasha Sloman	Head of Hospital Inspection	CQC
Apologies		
Marie Gabriel	Chair	East London NHS FT
Dr Henrietta Hughes	National Guardian for the NHS	National Guardian's Office
Baroness Dido Harding	Chair	NHS Improvement
Prof Dean Fathers	Chair	Nottingham Healthcare Trust
Lord David Prior	Chair	UCLH
Dr Neil Churchill	Director	NHS England
Prof Ted Baker	Chief Inspector - Hospitals	CQC
Adam Sewell-Jones	Executive Director of Improvement	NHS Improvement
Buki Adeyemo	Medical Director	North Stoke Combined NHS Trust
Michelle Drage	CEO	London-wide LMCs
Rob Webster	Chief Executive	South West Yorkshire Partnership NHS FT
Saffron Cordery	Director	NHS Providers
Alina Grossman	Clinical Fellow	OCDO Clinical Leaders of the Future Programme
Guest presenters		

Paper: WRES SAG 1

Dr David Ashton	WRES Frontline Forum Facilitator	Croydon Health Services NHS Trust
Jennifer Izekor	WRES Experts Prog Facilitator	Inspiring Hope
Chris Gonde	WRES Expert	King's College Hospital NHS FT
Sinead O'Neil	WRES Expert	Imperial College Healthcare NHS Trust
Shahana Ramsden	WRES Expert	NHS England